

# Quality Assurance and Compliance Onsite Monitoring Visit for Career and Technical Education

State College of Florida February18-20, 2014

**Final Report** 

# FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION



STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

GARY CHARTRAND, Chair JOHN R. PADGET, Vice Chair Members ADA G. ARMAS, M.D. JOHN A. COLÓN REBECCA FISHMAN LIPSAY ANDY TUCK Pam Stewart Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth Career and Adult Education

March 19, 2014

Dr. Carol Probstfeld, President State College of Florida P.O. Box 1849 Bradenton, FL 34206-1849

Dear Dr. Probstfeld:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report for the career and technical education program of State College of Florida. The report will also be placed on our website at <a href="http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp">http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp</a>.

Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi will be in touch with you for follow-up regarding any resolution activities that may be indicated in the report. We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by you and your staff during our visit. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Ellen McCarron, director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9033 or via electronic mail at Ellen.McCarron@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve educational services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Kal Durk

Rod Duckworth

RD/gpf

Enclosure

 cc: Daisy Vulovich, associate vice president, Corporate and Community Development and Career and Technical Education
Gloria Spradley-Brown, bureau chief, Grants Administration and Compliance
Ellen McCarron, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance
Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Authority	1
Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols	1
Provider Selection	1
Grants Fiscal Summary	2
Monitoring Activities	2
Results By Focus Area	4
Required Resolution Activities	8
Remarks or Positive Practices	8
Summary	9
Appendix A – Risk Matrix	.10
Appendix B – Resolution Plan	.11
	Authority Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols Provider Selection Grants Fiscal Summary Monitoring Activities Results By Focus Area Required Resolution Activities Remarks or Positive Practices Summary Appendix A – Risk Matrix

Florida Department of Education Division of Career and Adult Education

#### State College of Florida Career and Technical Education Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring Report

# I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education, in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance section is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the quality assurance system is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

# II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins (Perkins) Career and Technical Education Act of 2006. FDOE awards subgrants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and adult education/family literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for subgrants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of subgrantees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional citations noting pertinent laws and regulations and authority to monitor are located in the 2012-2013 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, module A, Section 1.

# III. MONITORING METHODS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols manual provides a summary of each facet of the division's monitoring program. The manual, located on the division's website at <a href="http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp">http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp</a>, was made available to the provider prior to the monitoring visit. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the manual in this document.

# IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the quality assurance system. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the FDOE and the division. A risk matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors is

completed for each provider. The risk matrix for each program monitored is located in Appendix A. The results of the risk assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for the college was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Dr. Carol F. Probstfeld, president of State College of Florida, on November 26, 2013. The designated representative for the agency was Ms. Daisy Vulovich, associate vice president for corporate and community development and career and technical education.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted February 18-20, 2014, by two representatives of the division's Quality Assurance and Compliance section: Ellen McCarron, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance; and program specialist, Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi.

# V. GRANTS FISCAL SUMMARY

ENROLLMENT- Fiscal Year (FY) 2011-12 CTE Postsecondary 4,188 (duplicated at program level)

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2011-12, 2012-13 and 2013-14:

2011-2012		
CAREER AND TECHNICAL	EDUCATION GRANTS	
Type	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
Postsecondary	\$549,383.00	\$60,187.27*
2012-2013		
CAREER AND TECHNICAL		1
Type	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
Postsecondary	\$532,660.00	\$8,660.65
2013-2014		
CAREER AND TECHNICAL	EDUCATION GRANTS	
Type	Total	Unexpended Funds
Postsecondary	\$447,743.00	NA

\* Unexpended funds greater than 10%

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: <u>https://www.scf.edu</u>

# VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls; an entrance conference; interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews; and an exit conference.

#### Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- Bradenton campus
- Venice campus

• Lakewood Ranch campus

### Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for the college was conducted on February 18, 2014; the exit conference was conducted on February 20, 2014. The participants are listed below:

Name	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Dr. Carol F. Probstfeld	President	Х	
Ms. Daisy Vulovich	Associate Vice President for Corporate and Community Development and Career and Technical Education	X	X
Ms. Sue Garland	Department Chair	Х	Х
Mr. Bradley W. Davis	Associate Vice President, Institutional Research	X X	X X
Ms. Beverly Hindenlang	Dean	Х	Х
Ms. Suhua Men	Director, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness	Х	Х
Mr. Gary Russell	Vice president, Academic Affair	Х	X X
Dr. Mike Mears	Vice President, Strategic Initiatives		Х
Ms. Karen Washington	Manager, Business Operations	Х	X X
Ms. Mary Ditaranto	Manager, Adjunct Faculty Coordinator	Х	Х
Mr. Feng Hou	Chief Information Officer	Х	
Ms. Gloria Tracy	Equity officer	Х	Х
Ms. Michele Redden	CTE Specialist	Х	Х
Ms. Marilynn Lewy	Associate Vice President, Student Services	Х	Х
Dr. Donald Bowman	Vice president, Student Services	Х	
Mr. George Cubberly	Manager, Financial Services	Х	Х
Mrs.Lynn Drees	Associate Vice President, Student Development	Х	
FDOE Monitoring Team			
Ellen McCarron	Director, Quality Assurance and Compliance	Х	Х
Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi	Program Specialist	Х	Х

#### Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff and students. A minimum of two interviews and observations were completed at each site. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

#### Records Review

Program, financial and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in section VII, item G. A minimum of 10 student records were reviewed. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

# VII. RESULTS BY FOCUS AREA

- A. <u>ADMINISTRATION</u> refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.
  - The presentation conducted by the college at the entrance meeting provided much insight about career and technical education programs.
  - Administrators are very knowledgeable and experienced about CTE programs.
  - The administrators work together cooperatively on a frequent basis.
  - Members of advisory councils include community business and civic leaders. All interviews with faculty and staff reflect knowledge of and participation in a wide variety of staff development opportunities.
  - The associate vice president for corporate and community development and career and technical education is very experienced and knowledgeable in her field of career and technical education.
  - Administration leadership, staff and policies are supportive of the CTE program.
  - Program managers participate in monthly meetings to discuss issues and concerns.
- **B.** <u>**DATA AND ASSESSMENT**</u> refers to all the components of the data and assessment system, including test administration, test security, data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
  - Verification of CTE industry certifications was completed.
  - A list of occupational completion points earned by students was verified.
  - Programs are evaluated on a yearly basis and information is shared with faculty for program effectiveness.
  - The data is used in decision-making and when evaluating CTE programs.
  - Instructors and administrators have access to and utilize student data.
  - The college has written policies and procedures for data collection and reporting.
  - Staff from the Office of Planning and Institutional Effectiveness participate in FDOE workforce development data meetings.
  - More cooperation and communication are needed between staff in the Office of Institutional Research and the CTE program.
  - The college has written policies and procedures for data collection and reporting.
  - Staff from the office of Institutional Research attended workforce development data meetings.
- C. <u>CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION</u> refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations. Faculties are using a range of instructional teaching strategies.
  - Students are interacting appropriately with faculty and instructors in the classroom.
  - The college is expanding the array of CTE programs in the Lakewood campus, including online instruction.
  - The community has access to the college's CTE programs and services, such as dental hygiene.
  - The college conducts periodic program reviews for CTE programs.
  - CTE programs are evaluated on a yearly basis and information is shared with faculty for program effectiveness.

- CTE programs are a blend of instructional and practical experiences for students.
- Distance learning is being integrated into learning and skill acquisition.
- Regarding the Venice campus:
  - Both of the students interviewed expressed an interest in having the scope of the engineering technology program expanded. One specific request was to add a full robotics program since they already have at least some of the equipment.
  - There is a need for additional student advisors in the engineering technology program. An instructor indicated that having additional permanent program advisors in the other campuses will increase student access to advising, as well as to relieve pressure on the one existing engineering technology advisor in Venice.
  - An instructor in the engineering technology program wants training in robotics so she can use the equipment she has.
- Regarding the Lakewood Ranch campus:
  - Students and instructors in the health program reported a strong desire for an electronic medical records component to be added to the simulation program.
  - The early childhood program instructor would like to see the training materials more user-friendly for the online program.
  - Also, in the early childhood program, the instructor expressed an interest for videos of daycare operations that could replace onsite student observations.
- **D.** <u>**TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT**</u> refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom: addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.
  - Computer equipment less than \$1,000 is tagged and included within the inventory.
  - There have not been any reports of loss, damage or theft in the last 12 months.
  - Technology was integrated into instruction for the CTE program.
  - Relevant technology is readily available for students use.
  - The college has a technology replacement plan that includes replacement of equipment within five years.
  - Equipment in dental hygiene program in the Bradenton campus is over 14 years-old. Life expectancy for this type of equipment is not more than 12 years.
  - Equipment purchased with grant funds was not readily located.
  - An instructor indicated that he "did not worry" about equipment transfer forms and that he considered the college's inventory procedures and processes to be "too bureaucratic."

#### **FINDING**

The inventory did not have all of the required elements according to the Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR) 34 CFR 80.32(d) (1) and state inventory rules, specifically 69I-73.005 and 691-73.006(c) (d) of the Florida Administrative Code.

- The monitoring team could not locate some of the equipment that was purchased with the grant funds in a timely manner for the following reasons:
  - The data element in the inventory database pertaining to room number was not accurate.
  - o There was a lack of internal controls for inventory documentation and tracking.
- E. <u>LEARNING ENVIRONMENT</u> encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.

- On all campuses, students reported high satisfaction with instruction and their overall educational experience.
- Buildings are well-maintained, classrooms are spacious and inviting.
- Textbooks and equipment are up to date.
- Classroom walls in general contain appropriate rules and related information.
- Students appear to be receiving the individual attention they need in the classroom.
- Regarding the Lakewood Ranch campus:
  - A large classroom in the nursing program, level four, contained state of the art instructional technology but the walls were barren.
  - High quality instruction in the nursing program was observed.
- Regarding the Venice campus:
  - The instructor in the engineering technology program is implementing a policy to increase student access to the laboratory facility by keeping a schedule with both daytime and nighttime hours. Students interviewed reported great appreciation of this policy.
  - Instruction in the engineering technology program is oriented toward jobs in the industry in general as well as the local market.
  - The instructor in the engineering technology program has initiated a pilot project to increase student access to classroom content. She is posting videos of class instruction online.
- **F.** <u>ACCESS AND EQUITY</u> refers to compliance with the requirements of federal nondiscrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.
  - The equity officer was very well-trained and knowledgeable about the recent civil rights legislation.
  - Accommodations are addressed as needed.
  - Non-discrimination notices were broadly posted.
  - Genetic identity has been incorporated as a protected class in the college's non-discrimination policy.
  - College faculty and staff are aware of the policies relating to the non-discrimination policy.

#### CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: Printed material does not include the non-discrimination notice.

*Recommendation:* Include the non-discrimination statement on printed materials during the next printing cycle.

*Agency Response:* The college is aware of this issue and currently is implementing policy and procedures for future printed material.

- **G.** <u>**RECORDS REVIEW**</u> refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.
  - Equipment inventory
  - College website

- Advisory council minutes
- 2013–2014 student handbook and planner
- 2013–2014 college catalog
- Student records
- Financial records
- College policies and procedures
- Program brochures
- Schedule of classes
- **H. <u>FINANCIAL</u>** refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs.
  - The purchasing process was reviewed, as well as a sample of purchases.
  - A sample of travel forms and the college's travel process were reviewed.
  - The agency personnel activity reports (PARs) are in order.
  - The college did not spend 100 percent of Perkins funding in fiscal year 2011-12. Over 10 percent of the grant funds remained at the end of the grant period.
  - Only one percent of grant funds were unexpended for the fiscal year 2012-13 year.
  - The associate vice president is informed on an ongoing basis of the rate of grant spending. Processes are in place to ensure funds are spent in a timely manner.
- I. <u>COLLABORATION</u> refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or memoranda of understanding (MOUs) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.
  - There is abundant evidence of vigorous collaboration between the college and the community.
  - The college has a service agreement with Manatee County School District for career pathways.
  - The college offers dual enrollment in Manatee and Sarasota County school districts.
  - The college has a policy for advisory committees, and the CTE program has an advisory committee.
  - There is one meeting for advisory committees college-wide, and these committees meet other times during the year to provide program support.
  - The college's collaboration with Gulf Coast University, University of South Florida and New College of Florida appears to be positive.
  - Collaboration with the community is obvious to optimize job opportunities for students.
  - On the Bradenton campus, the dental hygiene program offers community services four days a week.
  - The medical center at Lakewood Ranch provides clear pathways for students to jobs and is well supported by the community.
  - On the Venice campus, the engineering technology program has an advisory committee that helps integrate the curriculum to local job opportunities in related industries as well as to the labor market in general.
  - Internships are readily available to students.
- J. <u>PERKINS PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN</u> A Perkins program improvement plan (PIP) is required when an agency does not meet 90 percent of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

# 1. Postsecondary College Credit

For 2011-12, the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary measures except for:

- o 5P2 Non-traditional Completion 15 percent vs. 23 percent local agreed target
- o 2P1 Completion 33 percent vs. 49 percent local agreed target

Implementation strategies for completion and recruitment of non-traditional students were reviewed and verified with the college's designated representative.

- **K.** <u>STUDENT PERSPECTIVE</u> The team meets with groups of students; their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.
  - Students were highly satisfied with their programs of instruction.
  - Students were complimentary of their faculty and administration.
  - Students would like for the college to provide daycare where they offer the early childhood program. This could serve a dual purpose for student training and instructor observation as well as providing the childcare for students.
  - A student was interviewed on the Bradenton Campus who would like for the college to also offer biotechnology classes on the Lakewood Ranch campus.
  - A student in the engineering technology program is interested in robotics but needs to go to Daytona State College for the mechanical portion because it is not offered at State College of Florida.
  - A student in the engineering technology program reported that some instructors do not post grades in the online system in a timely manner so that students can see them to judge their progress.

# VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

- 1. Corrective action plan The college is required to complete an action plan (Appendix B) to address the finding noted in focus area D documented in Section VII above.
- 2. Action plan The college is required to complete an action plan (Appendix B) to address the concern noted in focus area F documented in Section VII above.

Once the resolution plan is submitted, reviewed, and approved, the leader of the onsite visit is responsible for the regular follow-up with the agency's designated representative to ensure that resolution is complete.

# IX. REMARKS

The following are additional comments made by the monitoring team in regard to the monitoring visit:

State College of Florida established one of the first collegiate middle schools in the country several years ago. What began with the sixth and seventh grades in 2010 with 135 students now has grades six through twelve attending classes at the Bradenton campus. This year, State College of Florida Collegiate School (SCFCS) reached capacity with 450 students enrolled on campus. The first SCFCS graduation of high school students will take place in spring 2014. This unique program allows motivated students to graduate high school with their high school diploma and an associate degree. A generous partnership with Florida Gulf Coast University offers SCFCS graduates a two-year scholarship for tuition and fees to complete their bachelor's degree. This will be offered to the first 10 graduating classes, beginning in 2014.

# X. SUMMARY

Once the field work is completed, including receipt of requested information, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The report is finalized and forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties, and is posted on the department's website at the following address: <u>http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/reports.asp</u>.

Finally, when all resolution activities are completed, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all State College of Florida participants in the onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks are offered to Daisy Vulovich, associate vice president for corporate and community development and career and technical education, for her participation and leadership in this process.

# APPENDIX A

# State College of Florida Career and Technical Education Risk Matrix

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
Total amount of	\$ 2,000,001+	8	_	
	700,001 - 2 million	6	x 6	30
agency funding from grants (2011-12)	300,001 - 700,000	5		
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2011-12)	Number of grants (1)	x 2	x 6	12
Number of grants with <b>10%</b> or more of unexpended funds (2011-12)	Number of grants (1)	x 5	x 4	20
Audit findings relevant to internal control weaknesses during three (3) previous years for targeted agency.	16 + findings	10		
	11-15 findings	8	x 10	80
	5-10 findings	6		
	1-4 findings	4		
Change in director within the last two (2) fiscal years.	Yes = <b>1</b> No = 0	x 10	x 4	40
		FOTAL Level of	Risk Score	182

# State College of Florida Resolution Plan Career and Technical Education

Corrective Action(s) or Action(s)	Action or Strategy to Address Finding or Concern	Person Responsible	Projected Date of Completion
<b>Corrective Action Plan</b> Finding: The inventory did not have all of the required elements according to the Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR) 34 CFR 80.32(d) (1) and state inventory rules 691-73.005 and 69I- 73.006(c)(d), Florida Administrative Code.	Action or strategy: Inventory reviewed during the visit has already been corrected within the system. A meeting has been scheduled on March 12, after spring break, with CTE, Karyn Washington and Josef Rill to review procedures for recording new inventory, asset tagging, and transmittal of equipment within and between campuses. Program Managers were informed of the findings at their monthly meeting on Feb. 28. Finance Director will review to ensure that all elements according to EDGAR, state inventory rules and Florida Administrative Code are included.	Josef Rill & Karyn Washington, Business Services George Cubberly, Finance Daisy Vulovich, CTE	May 2014
Action Plan Concern: Printed material does not include the non-discrimination notice as a protected class. Technical assistance needed and/or pro-	Action or strategy: Public Affairs & Marketing have already included new clause for future publications. It has already been implemented on website and materials published this year. Future CTE materials will contain the clause and will be standardized within the year.	Daisy Vulovich, CTE Debra Gingerich, Public Affairs & Marketing Gloria Tracy, Human Resources ensure it meets with their approval.	December 2014

Plan submits Education	ted by (name and title): Daisy Vulovich, Associate Vice President for Corporate and Community Development and Career and Technical Date: <u>March 10, 2014</u>
Plan accepted	by: Ellen McCarron Director, Quality Assurance and Compliance Date: March 12, 2014
Status of Rea	solution Plan (to be completed by DOE staff)
Date	Status of Plan Completion