



Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring
Career and Technical Education

Putnam County School District
March 25-27, 2013

Final Report
April 26, 2013

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION



STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

GARY CHARTRAND, *Chair*

Members

ADA G. ARMAS, M.D.

SALLY BRADSHAW

JOHN A. COLON

BARBARA S. FEINGOLD

JOHN R. PADGET

KATHLEEN SHANAHAN

Dr. Tony Bennett
Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor
Division of Career and Adult Education



April 26, 2013

Ms. Phyllis Criswell, Superintendent
Putnam County School District
200 South 7th Street
Palatka, Florida 32177-4612

Dear Superintendent Criswell:

We are pleased to provide you with the Final Report of the onsite monitoring of the Career and Technical Education programs from our visit on March 25-27, 2013. The report will also be placed on our website at: <http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp>.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during the review process. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi, Program Specialist, with the office of the Division of Quality Assurance and Compliance. Dr. Massoudi may be reached at 850/245-9056, or via electronic mail at Shahrokh.Massoudi@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/pr

Enclosure

Cc: Renee Hough
Shahrokh Massoudi

ROD DUCKWORTH, CHANCELLOR

325 W. GAINES STREET • TALLAHASSEE, FL 32399-0400 • (850) 245-0446 • www.fldoe.org/workforce

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Authority... ..	1
III.	Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols	1
IV.	Provider Selection	1
V.	Putnam County School District.....	2
VI.	Monitoring Activities.....	2
VII.	Results.....	3
VIII.	Required Resolution Activities	6
IX.	Targeted Technical Assistance.....	7
X.	Remarks or Positive Practices.....	7
XI.	Summary	7
XII.	Appendix A	8
XIII.	Appendix B	9

Florida Department of Education
Division of Career and Adult Education

**Putnam County School District
Career and Technical Education
Quality Assurance Monitoring Report**

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (Division), in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance section of the Bureau of Grants Administration and Compliance (Bureau) is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the Quality Assurance System is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the Division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE) for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006. FDOE awards sub grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and adult education/family literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the State has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of college boards of trustees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes (F.S.)).

Additional cites noting authority to monitor and pertinent laws and regulations are located in the 2012-2013 *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols*, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols* (Manual) was revised in the 2012-13 program year. The Manual was provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The Manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the Manual in this document; it is located on the Division's website at <http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp>.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the Quality Assurance System. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk Assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the FDOE and the Division. A Risk Matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors, is completed for each provider. The Risk Matrix for each program monitored is located in Appendix A. The results of the Risk Assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Putnam County School District (PCSD) was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Mr. Thomas D. Townsend, Superintendent, on July 18, 2012. The designated representative for the agency was Ms. Renee Hough, Director of the Career and Technical Education Program.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted March 25-27, 2013, by two representatives of the Quality Assurance section of the Division: Program Specialists, Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi and Ms. Sheryl Walden.

V. PUTNAM COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT

CTE secondary student enrollments (2010-11) Total student enrollments: 3,477

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2010-11, 2011-12:

2010-2011

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
540-1611A-1CS01	Secondary	\$209,306	0.00
540-1612A-1CR01	Secondary-Rural	\$ 57,859	0.00

2011-2012

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Unexpended Funds</u>
540-1612A-2CS01	Secondary	\$184,421	0.00
540-1612A-2CR01	Secondary-Rural	\$ 52,293	0.00

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address:

www.putnamschools.org.

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls; an entrance conference; interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews; and an exit conference.

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for the Putnam County School District was conducted on March 25, 2013. The exit conference was conducted on March 27, 2013. The participants are listed below:

Name	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Agency Participants			
Phyllis Criswell	Superintendent of the Putnam County School District	•	•
Helen Muir	Assistant Superintendent of the Putnam County School District	•	•
Renee Hough	CTE Director	•	•
Evelyn Langston	ESE Director		•
Kat Jenkins	Outreach Specialist	•	•
Janet Cauble	Career Specialist	•	
Deborah Decubellis	Human Resources	•	
Rhonda Odom	Chief Financial Officer	•	•
Laura France	Director of Elementary Education	•	

Vikki Miles	Statistician	•	•
Travis Weaver	School Safety Director		•
FDOE Staff		•	•
Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi	Program Specialist	•	•
Sheryl Walden	Program Specialist	•	•

Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff, career specialist, teachers and students. Fifteen interviews and eleven observations were conducted. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial, and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in Section VII. A minimum of eight student records were reviewed. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency’s website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

VII. RESULTS

Putnam County School District
 March 25-27, 2013

A. ADMINISTRATION refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.

- The CTE Director was well-organized and prepared for the visit.
- Administration is supportive of CTE programs.
- Administrators were welcoming, friendly and cooperative.
- Staff knew their school population (demographics, free and reduced lunch, etc.).
- A majority of teachers and administrators attended these schools and now work in the school system for the benefit of Putnam County students.
- We found experienced teachers in most CTE classrooms.
- Teachers displayed commitment to their students by buying shoes and clothes for student use.
- Staff had a commitment to serving the community in the culinary arts programs.
- The District has staff development plans for administration and staff in-service, conferences, and workshops.
- Career specialists visit the high schools and counsel students about future careers.
- CHOICES materials are used by the District for students in their career decision-making.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

B. DATA refers to all the components of the data system, including data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.

- The District has written policies for data collection and reporting.
- Perkins Program improvement strategies were discussed, and the District is improving.
- Administrators and teachers are using data to make decisions concerning the programs.
- Teachers use data as part of the evaluation process (attendance, tardiness, and participation).
- The District staff participates in an FDOE Community College and Technical Center Management Information Systems Advisory Committee and the Workforce District Data Advisory Committee meetings.
- There is much communication between the CTE Director and data staff.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

C. **CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION** refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.

- Teachers and students are active in the Career and Technical Students Organization (CTSOs) and have received many awards.
- Some textbooks are dated: Crescent City Welding - 2004; and Interlachen Criminal Justice - 2007.
- There is a lack of safety rules in class, specifically in the Crescent City Welding class.
- Levels 1-4 are combined in Palatka High School which creates problems for a CTE teacher.
- The Automotive Technology program at Palatka High School has applied for National Automotive Training Education Foundation (NATEF) certification.
- Culinary programs could benefit from partnerships with agriculture programs:
 - Agriculture programs could grow produce for culinary programs.
- Teachers are using a range of instructional strategies.
- There is an emphasis on project-based learning.
- Students are interacting appropriately with teachers in the classroom.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

D. **TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT** refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom; this addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.

- District has a \$1,000 threshold for capitalized equipment, but the grant requires tracking of equipment greater than \$500.
- Inventory contained required information and was easy to find as it was tagged and labeled.
- Palatka High School has an additional tag for Perkins equipment.
- Laptops have laser engraving.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

E. **LEARNING ENVIRONMENT** encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.

- Buildings are well-maintained, and classrooms are inviting.
- Classroom walls contain appropriate rules and other information.
- Students appear to be receiving the individual attention they need in the classroom.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Culinary Arts at Interlachen – There is no tile on floor in front of the commercial refrigerator and freezer, a hole in the wall, no hats, aprons or uniforms while working in the kitchen and the kitchen needs additional space to accommodate students.

Recommendation: The CTE Director needs to take immediate action to remedy these issues.

2. Concern: No safety procedures and rules posters are posted in the welding technology classroom in Crescent City High School.

Recommendation: Post safety procedures and rules in this classroom.

3. Concern: Textbooks for the CTE program are not current.

Recommendation: Textbooks need to be current/updated.

- F. **ACCESS AND EQUITY** refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.

- Non-discrimination notices were not broadly posted at Crescent City High School.
- Genetic identity has been incorporated as a protected class in the District's non-discrimination policy.
- Non-discrimination notice language is not consistent across District CTE programs.
 - Agency response: Will change it.
- Printed material non-discrimination statement does not include Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act (GINA).

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: A number of publications, including program brochures, need to be updated to include non-discrimination notices.

Recommendation: Revise printed materials to cover all protected classes as they are published.

- G. **RECORDS REVIEW** refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. The following are samples of financial and programmatic records reviewed:

- Travel
- Equipment inventory
- Agency website
- Pcards
- Purchasing and other finance policies and procedures
- Student records
- Advisory committee policy and minutes
- Non-discrimination policy
- Student certificates
- Board policies and procedures
- Financial and board policies and procedures
- Personnel Activity Reports (PARs) and certification statements
- Travel requests, authorizations, and reimbursement documentation
- Inventory lists for equipments purchased from the grants
- District website

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

H. **FINANCIAL** refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs.

- The purchasing process was reviewed, as well as a sample of purchases.
- A sample of travel and the District process was reviewed.
- The agency's personnel certifications are in order.
- Pcards are limited to just a select few administrators.
- The Financial Policy and Procedure Manual was reviewed.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

I. **COLLABORATION** refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.

- There are partnerships with hospitals, hospice, and doctor's offices for clinicals in allied health programs.
- There are partnerships with community business for advisory councils.
- There are partnerships with St. Johns River Community College, First Coast College, University North Florida, and University of Florida.
- Speakers are commonly used in CTE classes.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

J. **STUDENT PERSPECTIVE** – The team meets with groups of students and their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.

- Students were well-satisfied with their programs of instruction.
- Students were complimentary of their teachers and administration.
- Students are interested in continuing with their CTE programs after graduation.
- There is emphasis on "blue collar trades" jobs that are high skill and high wage.
- Many receive "real-world" experience in their CTE classes.
- Students have a lot of opportunities for field trips associated with career choices.
- Students were enthusiastic about their programs.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

Action Plan - The District must provide an Action Plan (Appendix C) to address the concerns noted in the focus Areas E and F in Section VII of this report.

Once the Corrective Action or Action Plan is submitted, reviewed, and approved, if appropriate, the co-leader of the onsite visit is responsible for the regular follow-up with the agency's designated representative to ensure that resolution is complete.

IX. TARGETED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Targeted technical assistance may be provided to support full compliance and systemic change for program improvement. Staff is encouraged to contact the Division staff to assist their efforts toward systemic change.

X. REMARKS or POSITIVE PRACTICES

The following are additional comments made by the Quality Assurance Team in regard to the monitoring visit:

- There was an agricultural village at the Putnam County Fair.
- There was participation by students at the fair with quilt, livestock and the Future Farmers of America exhibits.
- Preparation/catering of food for churches was provided by the culinary arts programs.
- There was a safety award for CTE programs at Palatka High (\$50) based on established safety criteria.

XI. SUMMARY

Once the field work (including receipt of requested information) is completed, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed and forwarded to the Agency Head with a copy to the appropriate parties. The Bureau's site visit leader monitors and conducts follow-up activities to assure issues have been satisfactorily completed within the stated timelines. Finally, the Bureau issues a Closure Notice to the Agency Head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all participants in the Putnam County School District onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks to Ms. Renee Hough for her participation and leadership in this process.

Appendix A
Putnam County School District
Risk Matrix

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
Total amount of agency funding from grants (2010-11)	\$ 2,000,001+	8	4 x 6	24
	700,001 – 2,000,000	6		
	300,001 - 700,000	5		
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2010-11)	Number of grants (2)	(2)x 2	4 x 6	24
Number of grants with 10% or more of unexpended funds (2010-11)	Number of grants	(0)x 5	0 x 4	0
Audit findings relevant to internal control weaknesses during three (3) previous years for targeted agency.	16 + findings	10	10 x 10	100
	11-15 findings	8		
	5-10 findings	6		
	1-4 findings	4		
Change in Director within the last two (2) fiscal years.	Yes = 1 No = 0	(1)x 10	10 x 4	40
TOTAL Level of Risk Score				188

Putnam County School District Resolution Plan
 Career and Technical Education

Type of Plan	Strategies	Person Responsible	Projected Date of Completion
Corrective Action Plan Finding(s):			
Action Plan Concerns: 1. Culinary Arts at Interlachen – No tile on floor in front of commercial refrigerator and freezer, hole in the wall, no hats, aprons, or uniforms while working in the kitchen, kitchen needs additional space to accommodate students. 2. Welding technology program at Crescent City High School – No safety rules posted. 3. Textbooks – Need to be current/updated. 4. Non-discrimination statements on printed materials – Need to reflect updated list.			
Technical Assistance Needed and/or Provided:			
Plan submitted by (name and title): <u>Renee Hough, Director, Career and Technical Education</u> Date: <u>April 22, 2013</u>			
Plan accepted by: <u>Gloria Spradley-Brown, Bureau Chief, Grants and Compliance</u> Date: <u>April 23, 2013</u>			
Status of Resolution Plan (to be completed by FDOE staff)			
Date	Status of Plan Completion:		

