

Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring

Adult Education and Family Literacy

Miami-Dade County School District

Final Report February 7, 2011

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

T. WILLARD FAIR, Chairman Members DR. AKSHAY DESAI MARK KAPLAN ROBERTO MARTÍNEZ JOHN R. PADGET KATHLEEN SHANAHAN SUSAN STORY Dr. Eric J. Smith Commissioner of Education

Loretta Costin, Chancellor Division of Career and Adult Education



February 7, 2011

Mr. Alberto M. Carvalho, Superintendent Miami-Dade County School District 1450 Northeast Second Avenue Miami, Florida 33132-1308

Dear Mr. Carvalho:

We are pleased to provide you with the Final Report of Monitoring of the Adult Education programs from our visit on December 6-8, 2010. The report will also be placed on our website at <u>http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp</u>.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during the review process. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Eileen L. Amy, Director of Quality Assurance and Compliance. Ms. Amy may be reached at 850/245-9033, or via electronic mail at <u>Eileen.Amy@fldoe.org</u>.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

ourse Costeni

Loretta Costin

LBC/ela

Enclosure

CC: Bobby Gornto Eileen L. Amy Rick Lockenbach



Table of Contents

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Authority	1
III.	Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocol	1
IV.	Provider Selection	1
V.	Miami-Dade County School District	2
VI.	Monitoring Activities	2
VII.	Results	3
VIII.	Required Resolution Activities	7
IX.	Remarks	7
Х.	Summary	7
XI.	Appendix A	8

Florida Department of Education Division of Career and Adult Education

Miami-Dade County School District Adult Education and Family Literacy Quality Assurance Monitoring Report

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (Division), in carrying out its roles of co-leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance section of the Bureau of Grants Administration and Compliance (Bureau) is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the Quality Assurance System is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the Division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The Florida Department of Education receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education for Adult Education and Family Literacy under the Adult Education and Family Literacy Act of 1998. FDOE awards sub grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plan for Adult Education. Each State shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the State has determined necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of district school boards in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes (F.S.)).

Additional cites noting authority to monitor and pertinent laws and regulations are located in the 2010-11 *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols*, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols* (Manual) was provided to agencies during September 2010 prior to the monitoring visit. The Manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the Manual in this document; the final document is located on the Division's website at http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the Quality Assurance System. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk Assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the Florida Department of Education and the Division of Career and Adult Education. A Risk Matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors, is completed for each provider. The Risk Matrix is located in Appendix A. The results of the Risk Assessment process and consideration of

available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Miami-Dade County School District (MDCSD) was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Alberto Carvalho, MDCSD Superintendent, on July 28, 2010. The designated representative for the agency was Bobby Gornto, MDCSD Administrative Director, District School Operations, Adult and Community Education.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted December 6-8, 2010, by four representatives of the Quality Assurance Section of the Division: Ms. Eileen L. Amy, Director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, and Program Specialists Tashi Williams, Sheryl Walden, and Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi.

V. MIAMI-DADE COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT

According to the Florida Department of Education Workforce Development Information System (WDIS) data base for 2008-09, MDCSD reported 95,675 Adult Education students. According to the district 2008-09 NRS Report, MDCSD reported 48,708 Adult Education student enrollments, with 4,880 enrolled in Adult Secondary Education, 7,658 enrolled in Adult Basic Education (ABE), and 36,170 enrolled in English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL).

The provider was awarded the following grants for FY 2008-09 and 2009-10:

2008-2009 ADULT EDUCATION GRANTS

Grant Number	Type	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
130-1919A-9CC04	Corrections	\$ 100,000	\$ 2,555.77
130-1919A-9CG01	Adult General Education	\$3,100,000	\$ 515.07
130-1939A-9CE01	EL/Civics	\$ 982,374	\$0
130-1919A-9CH01	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$ 5,671.54
130-1919A-9CH02	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$17,281.48
130-1919A-9CH03	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$ 2,024.19
130-1919A-9CH05	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$ 5,240.23
130-1919A-9CH06	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$ 1,762.26
130-1919A-9CH07	LE Households	\$ 150,000	\$39,730.35

2009-2010 ADULT EDUCATION GRANTS

Grant Number	<u>Type</u>	Total	Unexpended Funds
130-1910A-0CG01	Adult General Education	\$3,635,000	\$ 2,318.34
130-1930A-0CE01	EL/Civics	\$2,182,366	\$260,577.59

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: <u>http://www.dadeschools.net</u>.

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls, entrance conference, interviews with administrators, teachers, and students, observations, record reviews, and an exit conference.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to adult education and family literacy programs in the following locations:

- Lindsey-Hopkins Technical Education Center
- Miami Edison Middle School

- Southwest Adult Education Center
- Miami Senior Adult Education Center
- Ruben Dario Middle School
- Coral Park Adult Education Center
- The Rock Miami Church
- D.A. Dorsey Educational Center
- Feinberg/Fisher Elementary
- The English Center

Entrance Conference

The entrance conference for MDCSD was conducted on December 6, 2010, and included:

- District staff Bobby Gornto; Dr. Beatriz Diaz, District Supervisor of Adult ESOL Program; Carlos Manrique; Antonio Martinez; Anthenesia Jackson; Pam Johnson; Judith Cardona; Carlena Mitchell; Tamara Desronvil; Michele Mordica; Annette Calvo; Enrique Ros; and
- FDOE staff Ms. Eileen L. Amy, Tashi Williams, Sheryl Walden, and Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi.

Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff, and students. Sixty-nine persons were interviewed (including two Adult Education classes) and 20 observations were conducted. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial, and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in Section VIII, G. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed during the onsite visit.

Exit Conference

The exit conference for MDCSD was conducted on December 8, 2010.

VII. RESULTS

Miami-Dade County School District December 6-8, 2010

- A. <u>ADMINISTRATION</u> refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.
 - The district has eliminated a regional structure, so that principals of adult schools report to the MDCSD Administrative Director, District School Operations, Adult and Community Education.
 - Administrators and principals are well integrated into the organization; interactions clearly indicate a high level of involvement/collaboration between district and school-level staff.
 - Principals sign contracts to commit to student learning outcomes (Literacy Completion Points).
 - An Adult Career Pathways model to facilitate adult education student pathways to careers is a district-wide emphasis.
 - Case managers and tutors at each adult center are focused on student achievement and retention, with extensive personal contact and follow-up, including home visits.
 - Bobby Gornto convenes monthly meetings with school principals.
 - Admiration for Mr. Gornto's leadership/ethics/focus was evident and praised throughout the visit.
 - This same sentiment was commonly expressed by teachers regarding their relationships with their school principals.
 - Ample opportunities for growth exist within the system.

- Teachers and administrators repeatedly made positive statements about the district's ELITE Adult Education staff development conference held annually.
- There is an extensive schedule of staff development provided by district ESOL staff.
- There is an ongoing need to train new administrators, given retirement and other reasons to hire new administrators from one year to the next.
- The district has been responsive to issues identified in the prior visit two years before, with demonstrated improvement.
- Coral Park Adult Center has incorporated a "one-stop-shop" concept with counseling, computers for registration, cashier, etc., that has enhanced accessibility for students.
- The district uses a Request For Information (RFI) process for community-based organizations (CBOs) seeking federal grant funding under the Adult Education and Family Literacy Act as consortium partners.
- Adult education instructors are well qualified and experienced.
- Commitment to community and students by teachers and administrators was well expressed by students:
 - There is a strong desire to give back to the community.
 - Passion is evident.
 - A teacher's parents had immigrated to the U.S., and the teacher incorporated what she learned that they needed to know.
 - Teachers want to help students obtain a better life.
 - o "We have a real United Nations here; there is no conflict."

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

- **B.** <u>DATA</u> refers to all the components of the data system, including data collection, entry, and reporting. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
 - There is a strong emphasis on performance data.
 - Principals are held accountable with contracts geared to student achievement.
 - Principals hold teachers accountable.
 - New strategies and initiatives have been centered around data as relates to student achievement.
 - Teachers use Gradebook software to enter student attendance data.
 - Monthly reports on student achievements are available to teachers.
 - Reports are being used at all levels.
 - Accountability within ESOL is being addressed by monthly conferences with principals.
 - Schools are drawing data from their own servers.
 - The district tracks data on tutors, including tutor training.
 - Student data is readily accessible to principals and other Adult Education administrators.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

- C. <u>CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION</u> refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.
 - Teachers are following the FDOE Adult Education curriculum frameworks.
 - Teacher orientation is comprehensive.
 - Learning materials are current.
 - Teaching strategies are varied.

- Use of computers/texts/written words were common strategies observed in the classrooms.
- Group conversation in class is often used as an instructional strategy.
- Listening is a major focus of ESOL and other Adult Education classes.
- Teachers commonly stress real world experiences.
- Use of verbal interactions in the classroom is frequent.
- Use of Ventures Program interactive books for ESOL classes was observed.
- Due to the large population of students with limited English proficiency who need remediation to pursue career and technical education, there is a large ELCATE (English Language for Career and Technical Education) enrollment.

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

- D. <u>TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT</u> refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom; addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.
 - Different and current software programs are being utilized, with training from publishers.
 - The district sponsors an annual ELITE staff development conference and curriculum fair to expose Adult Education personnel to available instructional materials, including software and other technology-based materials.
 - Extensive use of Florida TechNet and online training by staff was evident.
 - The district promptly corrected erroneous information relating to Adult Education on the MDCSD website when brought to the attention of district staff prior to the visit.
 - Furniture and equipment are well maintained, with most appearing to be up-to-date.
 - Appropriate use of technology within the classroom by teachers and students was observed, especially computer labs that are part of the instruction.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

- E. <u>LEARNING ENVIRONMENT</u> encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.
 - Classrooms and buildings are clean.
 - Interaction between teachers and students appeared to be positive.
 - Review of basic expectations for students occurs frequently.
 - Calls and other means used to locate students not attending classes regularly for follow-up demonstrate a commitment to students.
 - When possible, the district may want to consider less desk chairs, and use more tables and chairs; some furniture is very small and difficult for some adults to use for extensive periods of time.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS None.

- F. ACCESS AND EQUITY refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.
 - While non-discrimination notices were not initially broadly posted at all locations, notices were posted prior to the end of the monitoring visit. The district has provided assurances that steps have been taken to address this issue in all facilities.
 - Staff is familiar with the process for addressing complaints of discrimination •

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

G. RECORDS REVIEW refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Both financial and programmatic records were reviewed.

The following were reviewed:

- Electronic and paper student records for Adult Education students
- Professional development plans, individual staff development plans, staff development • workshop agendas, and conference attendance
- Program brochures and other recruitment materials for Adult Education programs •
- Financial policies and procedures •
- Employee handbook
- District school board policies •
- Personnel Activity Reports (PARs) and personnel certifications
- Student assessment procedures
- H. FINANCIAL refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including a financial management system, a procurement system, and an inventory management system.
 - Principals are involved with purchasing decisions. •
 - No financial records are kept at the schools, as there is a centralized record-keeping system. •
 - Purchasing decisions are based on data relating to student enrollment and needs. •
 - Approval process for purchasing is extensive, requiring at least three or four levels of review.
 - Purchases reviewed had appropriate back-up, were well organized, and comprehensive. •
 - Substantial expenditures of grant funds were devoted to equipment licensing. •
 - A laptop cart was the only piece of equipment that was untagged, and the principal was • immediately notified at the school where this occurred.
 - Property acquired with grant funds was purchased and managed according to district • procedures and federal and state requirements.
 - Travel documentation was complete with appropriate signatures, and district policies and • procedures were followed.
 - Payroll records were reviewed. •
 - The issue of greater than 10% unexpended funds for one federal AEFLA grant for 2008-09 • was discussed with district staff.
 - To address this issue, the district has implemented a process to review expenditures on a \circ regular basis and redistribute grant funds not spent or obligated by April of each year.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None.

- I. <u>COLLABORATION</u> refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or memoranda of understanding to benefit an agency's programs and students.
 - Miami Dade College and MDCSD participate in several joint activities, and the College utilizes school district buildings for Adult Education classrooms.
 - Community organizations regularly make classroom presentations to enhance instruction.
 - The district shares federal grant funds through standardized affiliation agreements with CBOs.
 - The district provides the teacher and oversight of the program.
 - There is extensive monitoring of these grant funds by Enrique Ros, including frequent and unannounced visits to funded CBOs, to ensure accountability.

No findings of non-compliance were noted.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS None.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

CAREER AND TECHNICAL and ADULT EDUCATION

- 1. Corrective Action Plan No Corrective Action Plan is required.
- 2. Action Plan No Action Plan is required.

IX. REMARKS

The following additional comments are made by the Quality Assurance Team in regard to the monitoring visit: The district should be commended for the obvious high level of enthusiasm of Adult Education administrators, teachers, and students observed during the visit. The new administrative structure and leadership seem to be having a positive effect on the district's implementation of new initiatives; student goals and program focus is more clear. Visiting FDOE staff appreciated the program overview provided during the entrance conference.

X. SUMMARY

Once the field work is completed (including receipt of requested information), a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed and forwarded to the Agency Head with a copy to the appropriate parties. The Bureau's site visit co-leader monitors and conducts follow-up activities to assure issues have been satisfactorily completed within the stated timelines. Finally, the Bureau issues a Closure Notice to the Agency Head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all participants in the MDCSD's onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks to Bobby Gornto, Carlos Manrique, Antonio Martinez and Dr. Beatriz Diaz for their participation and leadership in this process.

Appendix A Miami-Dade County School District Risk Matrix for Adult Education

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
	\$ 2,000,001+	8	-	
Total amount of agency	700,001 - 2 million	6	X 6	= 48
funding from grants (2008-09)	300,001 - 700,000	5	-	(total points)
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2008-09)	Per grant (2)	2	X 6	= 96
Number of grants with 10% or more of unexpended funds (2008-09)	Per grant (1)	5	X 4	= 20
	16 + findings	10		
Audit findings relevant to internal control	11-15 findings	8		400
weaknesses during three (3) previous years	5-10 findings	6	X10	=100
for targeted agency.	1-4 findings	4		
Key organizational change within the last two (2) years.	Director (1)	10	X 4	= 40
тс	304			