

Quality Assurance and Compliance Onsite Monitoring Visit for Career and Technical Education

Edison State College March 25-28, 2014

Final Report

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION



Pam Stewart Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth Career and Adult Education

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

GARY CHARTRAND, Chair

JOHN R. PADGET, Vice Chair

Members

ADA G. ARMAS, M.D. JOHN A. COLÓN

REBECCA FISHMAN LIPSAY

ANDY TUCK

May 6, 2014

Dr. Jeffery Allbritten, President Edison State College 8099 College Parkway Ft. Myers, FL 33919

Dear Dr. Allbritten:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report for the career and technical education program of Edison State College. The report will also be placed on our website at http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp.

Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi will be in touch with you for follow-up regarding any resolution activities that may be indicated in the report. We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by you and your staff during our visit. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Ellen McCarron, director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9033 or via electronic mail at Ellen.McCarron@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve educational services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/shm

Enclosure

cc: Randall W. Hanna, chancellor, Division of Florida Colleges
Dr. John Mayer, dean, School of Business and Technology
Gloria Spradley-Brown, bureau chief, Grants Administration and Compliance
Ellen McCarron, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance

Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| I. | Introduction | .1 |
|-------|---|-----|
| II. | Authority | .1 |
| | Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols | |
| IV. | Provider Selection | .1 |
| V. | Grants Fiscal Summary | .2 |
| VI. | Monitoring Activities | .2 |
| VII. | Results By Focus Area | .3 |
| VIII. | Required Resolution Activities | .7 |
| IX. | Remarks or Positive Practices | .7 |
| X. | Summary | .7 |
| | Appendix A – Risk Matrix | .8 |
| | Appendix B – Resolution Plan | .9 |
| | Attachment1 | i 1 |

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education, in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance section is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the quality assurance system is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins (Perkins) Career and Technical Education Act of 2006. FDOE awards subgrants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and adult education/family literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for subgrants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of subgrantees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional citations noting pertinent laws and regulations and authority to monitor are located in the 2013-2014 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, module A, Section 1.

III. MONITORING METHODS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols manual provides a summary of each facet of the division's monitoring program. The manual, located on the division's website at http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp, was made available to the provider prior to the monitoring visit. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the manual in this document.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Edison State College was selected for onsite monitoring using a risk-based approach to assess factors such as overall grant budgets, changes in program leadership, numbers of prior audit findings and other factors. Notification was sent to Dr. Jeffery Allbritten, president of Edison State College, on November 26, 2013. The designated representative for the agency was Dr. John Meyer, dean, School of Business and Technology.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted March 25-28, 2014, by two representatives of the division's Quality Assurance and Compliance section: program specialists Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi and Mr. Tashi Williams.

V. GRANTS FISCAL SUMMARY

ENROLLMENT- Fiscal Year (FY) 2011-12:

CTE Postsecondary - 5,199 (duplicated at program level)

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2011-12, 2012-13 and 2013-14:

2011-2012

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Type</u> <u>Total</u> <u>Unexpended Funds</u>

Postsecondary \$605,560.00 \$16,796.77

2012-2013

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Type</u> <u>Total</u> <u>Unexpended Funds</u>

Postsecondary \$644,085.00 \$13,894.00

2013-2014

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Type</u> <u>Total</u> <u>Unexpended Funds</u>

Postsecondary \$520,378.00 NA

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: https://www.Edison.edu

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls; an entrance conference; interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews; and an exit conference.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- Lee campus
- Collier campus

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for the college was conducted on March 25, 2014. The exit conference was conducted on March 28, 2014. The participants are listed below:

| Name | Title | Entrance Conference | Exit Conference |
|-------------------|--|------------------------|--------------------|
| Dr. John Meyer | Dean, School of Business and Technology | X | X |
| Dr. Marie Collins | Dean, School of Health Professions | X | |
| Andrea Jones | Director, Academic Advising | X | X |
| Ron Dente | Director, Human Resources and | X | |

| | College Equity Officer | | |
|------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|
| Steve Nice | Director, Facilities Planning and | X | |
| | Development | | |
| Charlene Wolfe | Program Support Specialist | X | X |
| Dr.Thomas Rath | Associate Dean, School of | X | X |
| | Business and Technology | | |
| Garnett Salmon | Interim Registrar | X | |
| Angela Hartsell | Director, Adaptive Services | X | |
| Kevin Kennedy | Coordinator, Career Services | X | |
| Mark Morgan | Career Specialist | X | |
| Jason Dudley | Chief Information Officer | X | |
| Antranette Forbes | Grants Development Specialist | X | |
| Lorraine Bailey-Hayden | Coordinator, Construction and | X | |
| | Fixed Assets Accounting | | |
| Lisa Tudor | Director, Procurement Services | X | |
| Toby Discenza | Director, Budget and Financial | X | |
| | Services | | |
| Dr. Jeff Stewart | Vice President, Research, | X | |
| | Technology and Accountability | | |
| Dr. Laura Weir | Assistant Vice President, | X | |
| | Academic Affairs | | |
| Abby Willcox | Director, Institutional Research | X | X |
| Lisa Dick | Assistant to Dean of Business and | | X |
| | Technology | | |
| Dr. Christine Davis | Vice President, Student Affairs | | X |
| | and Enrollment Management | | |
| FDOE Monitoring Team | | | |
| Tashi Williams | Program Specialist | X | X |
| Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi | Program Specialist | X | X |

Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff and students. A minimum of two interviews and observations were completed at each site. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in section VII, item G. A minimum of 10 student records were reviewed. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

VII. RESULTS BY FOCUS AREA

- **A.** <u>ADMINISTRATION</u> refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.
 - The CTE programs appear to be highly structured.
 - The School of Health Professions benefits from having highly experienced faculty and instructors.
 - The dental hygiene program has a passing rate of one hundred percent.

- The business and technology program faculty are knowledgeable and very experienced.
- Advisory committee members are representative of the local business, industry, and college faculty.
- Staff development is available to faculty and instructors.
- The college offers staff development and in-service training twice per year.
- Ongoing staff development events are posted.
- The dean of the School of Business and Technology is very experienced and knowledgeable in his field of career and technical education.
- The dean of the School of Health Professions brings many years of experience and new vision for future expansion of the program.
- The administration is supportive of the career and technical education program.
- There is excellent communication within the college's administration.
- The college celebrates annual student appreciation day.
- The local business community offers services to students and also provides exhibits at various college events.
- The instructors are required to be certified in their respective program areas.
- The college's Simulation Education Medical Center has been recognized by the medical community as a state-of-the-art facility.
- **B.** <u>DATA AND ASSESSMENT</u> refers to all the components of the data and assessment system, including test administration, test security, data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
 - The college has written policies and procedures for data collection and reporting.
 - A sample of records of students earning industry certification was verified.
 - A sample of records of students' program completers was verified.
 - Performance improvement plan strategies were discussed for performance indicators that did not meet the local target.
 - Staff from the Office of Institutional Research participated in FDOE workforce development data meetings.
 - Data is used to ensure learning outcomes are met.
 - The college uses BANNER software for student data collection.
- **C.** <u>CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION</u> refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.
 - Faculty are using a range of instructional teaching strategies.
 - The students are interacting appropriately with faculty and instructors in the classroom.
 - The college has a plan for future expansion of CTE programs for the Charlotte campus.
 - The college offers on-line classes.
 - The college conducts program reviews for CTE programs.
 - There is a direct relationship between academic and CTE programs.
 - Faculty breakout sessions allow faculty members to meet and make decisions as one.
 - The majority of the CTE programs lead to industry-recognized credentials or certificates.
 - A variety of internships and labs provide real-life working experiences for students.
 - The CTE programs follow the state curriculum frameworks.

- **D.** <u>TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT</u> refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom: addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.
 - Equipment purchased with grant funds was readily located and tagged.
 - The inventory contained all elements as required by Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR).
 - The inventory also contained a Perkins-specific tag in addition to the college's normal inventory system tag.
 - The college is in process of developing a technology replacement plan that includes the replacement of equipment within established timelines set forth by the college programs.
 - The college inventory system is in place, with a \$1,000 threshold for capitalized equipment.
 - Computer equipment less than \$1,000 is also included within the inventory.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: The Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) program at the Lee campus had an insufficient number of tablets for use by students while training onsite.

Recommendation: The college needs to review the EMT program and provide a sufficient number of tablets for students to use in the program.

Concern: At the Lee campus EMT program, internet connectivity was not sufficiently up to speed to satisfy student instructional needs.

Recommendation: Working through the Instructional Technology Department, evaluate the adequacy of internet performance to improve data accessibility and consider investing in data/network upgrades.

- **E.** <u>LEARNING ENVIRONMENT</u> encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.
 - The students reported high satisfaction with instruction and their overall educational experience on both the Lee and Collier campuses.
 - The buildings are well-maintained and the classrooms are spacious and inviting.
 - The textbooks and equipment are only marginally up to date.
 - The classroom walls in general contain appropriate rules and related information.
 - The students appear to be receiving the individual attention they need in the classroom.
- **F.** <u>ACCESS AND EQUITY</u> refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.
 - The human resources director is knowledgeable about the civil rights legislation.
 - Accommodations are addressed as needed.
 - The non-discrimination notices were broadly posted.
 - Genetic identity has been incorporated as a protected class in the college's non-discrimination policy.
 - The faculty and staff are aware of the college's policies relating to non-discrimination.

- **G. RECORDS REVIEW** refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.
 - Equipment inventory
 - College website
 - Travel
 - 2013–2014 student handbook
 - Student records
 - Financial records
 - College policies and procedures
 - Program brochures
 - Schedule of classes
 - Personnel Activity Reports (PARs) and certifications
 - Non-discrimination policy
 - Student records
- **H. FINANCIAL** refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs.
 - The purchasing process and a sample of purchases were reviewed. A sample of travel forms and the college's travel process were reviewed.
 - The college's PARs are in order.
 - The dean of business and technology is informed on an ongoing basis of the rate of grant spending.
 - The college has a process for college-wide budget review.
- **I.** <u>COLLABORATION</u> refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or memoranda of understanding (MOUs) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.
 - The college has a service agreement with technical centers in Lee, Collier and Charlotte counties.
 - The college has collaboration agreement with Hodges University.
 - Collaboration with the community is obvious to optimize job opportunities for students.
 - The community has access to programs and services, such as dental hygiene, which is offered three days a week at the Lee campus.
 - The Medical Simulation Education Center at the Collier campus provides clear pathways for students to get jobs and also has strong community support.
 - Internships are readily available to students on the Lee and Collier campuses.
- **J.** PERKINS PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN A Perkins program improvement plan (PIP) is required when an agency does not meet 90 percent of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

1. Postsecondary College Credit

For 2011-12, the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary measures except for:

o 5P1 Non-traditional enrollment 4.76 percent vs.12.00 percent

Implementation strategies for non-traditional enrollment were reviewed and verified with the college's dean of the School of Business and Technology.

- **K.** <u>STUDENT PERSPECTIVE</u> The team meets with groups of students; their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.
 - The students were highly satisfied with their programs of instruction.
 - The students were complimentary of their faculty and administration.
 - The students were very pleased with the time and location of the programs.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: Students in the EMT program at the Lee campus and the nursing program at the Collier campus expressed concern about student advisors' level of program knowledge.

Recommendation: The college is advised to provide ongoing training to academic advisors to ensure they are current on all program changes.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

1. Action plan – The college is required to complete an action plan (Appendix B) to address the concerns noted in focus areas D and K documented in Section VII above.

Once the resolution plan is submitted, reviewed and approved, the leader of the onsite visit is responsible for the regular follow-up with the agency's designated representative to ensure that resolution is complete.

IX. REMARKS

Attachment A is provided by Edison State College on exemplary programs and practices.

The following are additional comments made by the monitoring team in regard to the monitoring visit:

Edison College is commended on the quality of their equipment inventory system. The system contains all of the required elements according to the (EDGAR) 34 CFR 80.32 and state inventory rules 691-72.003, Florida Administrative Code. In addition, the computers and monitors less than \$1000 purchased with grant funds are also part of the college's inventory system and contained additional Perkins-specific tagging.

X. SUMMARY

Once the field work is completed, including receipt of requested information, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The report is finalized and forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties, and is posted on the department's website at the following address: http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/reports.asp.

Finally, when all resolution activities are completed, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all Edison State College participants in the onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks are offered to Dr. John Meyer, dean school of business and technology, for his participation and leadership in this process.

APPENDIX A

Edison State College Career and Technical Education Risk Matrix

| Risk Factor | Criteria Scale | Value | Risk Factor Weight | Total Points |
|---|----------------------|-------|--------------------------|-----------------|
| | \$ 2,000,001+ | 8 | | |
| Total amount of | 700,001 - 2 million | 6 | x 6 | 30 |
| agency funding from grants (2011-12) | 300,001 - 700,000 | 5 | | |
| | < 300,000 | 4 | | |
| Number of grants per agency (2011-12) | Number of grants (1) | x 2 | х б | 12 |
| Number of grants with 10% or more of unexpended funds (2011-12) | Number of grants (0) | x 5 | x 4 | 0 |
| | 16 + findings | 10 | | |
| Audit findings relevant to internal | 11-15 findings | 8 | x 10 | 60 |
| control weaknesses during three (3) | 5-10 findings | 6 | | |
| previous years for targeted agency. | 1-4 findings | 4 | | |
| Change in director within the last two (2) fiscal years. | Yes = 1 No = 0 | x 10 | x 4 | 40 |
| TOTAL Level of Risk Score | | | | 142 |

Appendix B Career and Technical Education Edison State College Resolution Plan

| Actions Plan(s) | Action or Strategy to Address Concern | Person Responsible | Projected Date of Completion |
|---|---|--|---------------------------------|
| The Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) program at the Lee campus had an insufficient number of tablets for use by students while training onsite. | The college will purchase and tag a sufficient number (approximately 76) of Panasonic Toughbook Convertible Tablet computers for EMT students' use on ambulance ride-alongs and other onsite training activities. These computers will be stored at each firehouse or ambulance station where the ambulances are garaged. Students will use them while training and return them for the next student's use at the end of that day's training. | Dr. John Meyer, Dean of the School of Business and Technology in collaboration with Joe Washburn, Program Director of Emergency Service Programs and with Edison State College Technology Services | June, 2014 |
| The Lee campus EMT program, internet connectivity was not sufficiently up to speed to satisfy student instructional needs. | Technology Services performed an access survey in Building B. The results indicate that there are three areas of low coverage. Technology Services will install 3 additional access points - one each in B-113, B-126, and the ambulance simulator area. | Jason Dudley, Chief Information Officer | June, 2014 |
| Students in the EMT program at the Lee campus and the nursing program at the Collier campus expressed concern about student advisors' level of program knowledge. | The college has scheduled Advisor Training Sessions with School Deans to provide updates on programmatic changes and to review programmatic prerequisites, requirements, schedules, educational plans, and related matters. The dates of the upcoming meetings are as follows: 4/17/14, focus on School of Health Professions and School of Business and Technology 5/1/14, focus on follow up 5/22/14 Similar | Andrae Jones, Director of Academic Advising | June, 2014 |

| | | update trainings will be scheduled for each academic year or more frequently as conditions dictate. | | | |
|---|--------------------------------|---|--|---------|--|
| | | dictate. | | | |
| | | In addition, on 2/26/14, the college piloted a survey with students on the Charlotte campus | | Ongoing | |
| | | to assess student satisfaction with their | | | |
| | | interaction with advisors. The survey will be | | | |
| | | implemented college-wide for the Fall term. Results of the survey will be tracked and used | | | |
| | | to help inform Advising Policies and | | | |
| | | Procedures. | | | |
| | | Lastly, the Director of Academic Advising is | | Ongoing | |
| | | promoting term-by-term education plans so | | | |
| | | that students will have a visual guide as | | | |
| | | prerequisites are met. | | | |
| Technical assistance needed and/or provided: Will ask FDOE to review inventory plan to ensure it meets with their approval. | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Plan submitted by (name and title): <u>Dr. John Meyer, Dean, School of Business and Technology</u> Date: 4-17-2014 | | | | | |
| Plan accepted by: Ellen McCarron, Director, Compliance Section Date: 4/29/2014 | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| Status of Resolution Plan (to be completed by DOE staff) | | | | | |
| Date | Date Status of Plan Completion | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | 1 | | | | |

Attachment A

Celebrating over 50 years of excellence, Edison State College is Southwest Florida's largest, most accessible and ranked nationally as one of the most affordable institutions of higher education. Serving more than 22,000 students per year regionally, nationally, and internationally (approximately 1.3% of our students come from outside the region), students are also active in a wide variety of clubs and programs that cater to their interests. Nationally, Edison State is ranked 45th among associate degree producers and 26th for its prestigious associate producing Nursing program. Its primary service area covers five counties and over 6,550 square miles.

Edison State offers 18 different AS degree programs, 10 different certificate programs, and 10 different baccalaureate degrees. In addition, it offers two AS degrees and three certificates in partnership with other colleges.

Edison State is a major economic force in the five-county region it serves. According to a March 2013 EMSI brief, its total annual impact amounts to \$410.6 million for the region.

School of Health Professions

Edison State College's School of Health Professions offers many diverse options for students who want to pursue a career in the rewarding field of healthcare. According to the US Bureau of Labor Statistics, occupations related to health care are projected to have the fastest job growth between 2010 and 2020.

Nursing, Paramedic, and Emergency Medical Technician academic programs are offered on all three campuses in Charlotte, Collier, and Lee counties. These health professions programs hold national accreditation as well as approval by Florida Department of Health.

Graduates of our programs in the health professions are extremely successful on credentialing examinations and with finding employment after graduation. Their pass rates soar above the national average and some programs have a decade or more of 100% pass rates on national examinations.

In addition to the valuable clinical experiences made available by our community hospitals and affiliates, Edison State College boasts a state-of-the-art Simulation Education Center that has obtained global recognition. Interprofessional simulation scenarios have been created and enacted to include students in the Nursing, Respiratory Care, Cardiovascular Technology, Paramedic, and Dental Hygiene programs. Our nationally accredited Cardiovascular Technology program is the only one in the nation equipped with a cardiovascular catheterization laboratory that incorporates endovascular simulation.

Faculty, staff, and students in the School of Health Professions are active in community and professional activities at the local, state, national, and international levels. In 2014, the Associate Dean of Nursing was granted a Fulbright scholarship and completed a study in Russia. The newly renovated state-of-the-art Dental Hygiene Clinic is located on the Lee campus of Edison State College. Students provide preventive dentistry care to over 2,000 patients per year from our surrounding communities.

School of Business and Technology

In the School of Business and Technology, Edison State College offers programs that are relevant, challenging, and designed to help equip students with the kind of education that is in demand by many employers today. Our programs help students train for fields in areas found on the regional Targeted

Occupations List and 79% of these are also in the High Skill, High Wage (HSHW) category. The School of Business and Technology is committed to providing excellence in education and helping our students build professional skills through continuously updated curricula, modern facilities and technology across all programs.

It has partnered with Florida Gulf Coast University and Hodges University on *Workforce Now*, a regional research initiative to identify current and future talent requirements for the five counties of Southwest Florida. The initiative was created in October 2012 and is envisioned as a systematic, strategic multi-year focus on understanding and meeting critical workforce needs. The initiative is designed to provide better information on workforce gaps, including skills and characteristics desired by regional employers. The plan is to study up to six industries or sectors per year to provide a continuous stream of information from employers to educational institutions and to look for ways to create dialogue and new partnerships between businesses and educational institutions. The quality of the regional workforce is a primary competitive factor in the region's ability to grow and prosper in a competitive global marketplace.

Additionally, the School of Business and Technology has partnered with the Horizon Council, Lee County's economic development advisory body, to study how to best mitigate a deficiency in foundational skills among potential employees. The foundational skills gaps is one identified by Workforce Now as impacting all studied economic sectors in the region.

The faculty members within the School are all highly academically qualified to teach in their fields. The overwhelming majority of the members of the faculty are past or present practitioners in their respective industries. In addition to bringing real-world relevance into the classroom, our professors are also actively engaged in educational projects, service to the college, and service to the community.