

Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring

Columbia County School District

Career and Technical Education and Adult Education and Family Literacy

May 6-8, 2013

Final Report

August 20, 2013

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION



STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

GARY CHARTRAND, Chair JOHN R. PADGET, Vice Chair Members ADA G. ARMAS, M.D. SALLY BRADSHAW JOHN A. COLÓN BARBARA S. FEINGOLD KATHLEEN SHANAHAN

August 20, 2013

Terry Huddleston, Superintendent Columbia County School District 372 West Duval Street Lake City, Florida 32055

Dear Superintendent Huddleston:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report of the adult education and career and technical education programs from our visit. The report will also be placed on our website at http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during the review process. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Rick Lockenbach, J.D., program specialist with Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9025 or via electronic mail at <u>rick.lockenbach@fldoe.org</u>.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/rl

Enclosure

cc: Alex Carswell Ellen McCarron Rick Lockenbach, J.D. Pam Stewart Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor Career and Adult Education



TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Authority	1
III.	Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols	1
IV.	Provider Selection	2
V.	Columbia County School District	2
VI.	Monitoring Activities	3
VII.	Results	4
VIII.	Required Resolution Activities	10
IX.	Targeted Technical Assistance	10
X.	Remarks or Positive Practices	10
XI.	Summary	11
XII.	Appendix A	12
XIII.	Appendix B	14

Florida Department of Education Division of Career and Adult Education

Columbia County School District Adult Education and Family Literacy and Career and Technical Education Quality Assurance Monitoring Report

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education, in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance section of the division is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the Quality Assurance System is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins IV Career and Technical Education Act of 2006 (Perkins) and for Adult Education (AE) and Family Literacy under the Adult Education and Family Literacy Act of 1998. FDOE awards sub-grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. The FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and AE. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of district school boards in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes.)

Additional cites noting authority to monitor and pertinent laws and regulations are located in the 2012-2013 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols was revised in the 2012-13 program year. The manual was provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains

protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the Manual in this document; it is located on the division's website at <u>http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp</u>.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the Quality Assurance System. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk Assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assigns a rating for the level of risk to the FDOE and the division. A risk matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors, is completed for each provider. The risk matrix for each program monitored is located in Appendix A. The results of the risk assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategies to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Columbia County School District was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Mr. Michael F. Millikin, superintendent, on July 14, 2012. The designated representative for the agency was Mary Keen, Career and Adult Education coordinator.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted May 6-8, 2013, by two representatives of the Quality Assurance and Compliance section of the division: Program Specialists Rick Lockenbach, J.D., and Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi.

V. COLUMBIA COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT

2011-12 Enrollmen	its	
CTE Secondary	Adult General Education	<u>Total</u>
3,022	445	3,467

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2010-11 and 2011-12:

2010-2011

ADULT EDUCATION GRANTS					
TypeTotalUnexpended Funds					
Adult General Education	\$94,963	\$0			
EL/ Civics	\$26,262	\$15,147.40			

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

Type	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
Secondary	\$145,911	\$0
Rural	\$114,046	\$20,012.86

2011-2012

2011-2012		
ADULT EDUCATION GRANTS		
<u>Type</u>	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
Adult General Education	\$116,092	\$0
EL/Civics	\$ 23,784	\$0
EL/Civics (Suwannee County)	\$ 26,262	\$0
AE Career Pathways	\$ 66,535	\$0

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

<u>Type</u>	<u>Total</u>	Unexpended Funds
Secondary	\$126,141	\$0
Rural	\$ 67,132	\$0

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: <u>http://www.columbia.k12.fl.us</u>

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls; an entrance conference; interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews; and an exit conference.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- Columbia High School (CTE)
- Fort White High School (CTE and AE)
- Columbia County School District (AE)

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for the Columbia County School District was conducted on March 6, 2013; the exit conference was conducted on March 8, 2013. The participants are listed below:

Agency Participant	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Mary Keen	Career and adult education coordinator	Х	Х
Janora Crowe	Transition specialist	X	Х
Carrie Rodriguez	Clerk typist	X	Х
FDOE Monitoring Team			
Rick Lockenbach, J.D.	Program specialist	X	Х
Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi	Program specialist	X	Х

Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff, program and transition specialists, and students. There were 17 interviews and ten observations that were conducted. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in Section VIII, Section G. Some policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

VII. RESULTS

Columbia County School District March 6-8, 2013

- A. <u>ADMINISTRATION</u> refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.
- The level of administrator support for CTE programs at all levels is impressive.
- There is a strong commitment to career academies and industry certification; an example of the latter is students can earn Microsoft certifications in multiple programs at Columbia High School.
- Advisory committees are in place and provide significant input and support for CTE and AE programs.
- Workforce Education has a strong and experienced district administrative team.
- Teachers are required to perform a self-evaluation at the end of each year.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS None

- **B.** <u>**DATA**</u> refers to all the components of the data system, including data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
- The process for data collection and reporting for AE and CTE students was reviewed.
- Samples of records of students who earned AE completions and CTE industry certifications were verified.
- AE data entry and district level CTE Management Information System (MIS) staff is experienced and very familiar with the agency database.
- District staff regularly attends FDOE Workforce Education District Data Advisory Committee meetings.
- Data is being used by CTE programs for program improvement purposes.

• Columbia County School District is following FDOE assessment guidelines in the administration of the Test of Adult Basic Education and Comprehensive Adult Student Assessment System.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: CTE program staff has limited involvement with secondary CTE data submission to ensure data accuracy and timeliness.

Recommendation: Develop an internal review process that includes CTE program staff to review data, including edit reports, prior to the required load date through the end of the submission period for each survey period.

- C. <u>CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION</u> refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.
- Instructional materials are current and are being utilized in the classroom.
- Varied instructional strategies are being employed.
- Interaction between teachers and students was very positive.
- Teachers are following FDOE curriculum frameworks for CTE and AE.
- Several CTE programs are National Construction Center for Education and Research accredited.
- In the hydroponics program at Ft. White High School, students are raising plants and fish together, researching the nutrient uptake in plants growing with waste produced by the fish.
- The Building Construction Program at Columbia High School has built a house a year for the last several years in partnership with local non-profits.
- Students in a CTE program at Columbia High School operate an apparel store at Columbia High School.
- Students in Future Farmers of America, Health Occupations Student Association and other career and technical student organizations (CTSOs) have excelled in recent state and national competitions.
- The Graphic Arts Program at Columbia High School produces school yearbook and other school materials.
- AE program staff has presented at several workshops on the district's AE Career Pathways Program, which is a comprehensive program
 - Components include career advising, college preparatory instruction, and projectbased learning.

FINDINGS

The Automotive Service Technology program at Columbia High School is not National Automotive Technician Education Foundation (NATEF) accredited as required by state law.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Concern: In the automotive service technology program at Columbia High School, textbooks are dated 2004 and may not be current. There are no computers in this classroom.

Recommendation: Evaluate instructional materials in this program to determine the need for newer materials and computers.

2. Concern: While most GED[®] (General Education Development[®]) teachers are receiving staff development for the new GED[®] test that takes effect in January 2014, at least one instructor has not received this training to date.

Recommendation: Evaluate the need for adult education $\text{GED}^{\text{®}}$ teachers to participate in additional staff development for the new $\text{GED}^{\text{®}}$ test.

3. Concern: While career guidance is a strong emphasis in Columbia County School District's AE program, CTE students are receiving limited career guidance assistance in the high schools.

Recommendation: Expand career guidance efforts for CTE students through the increased use of Florida CHOICES career development software and/or other strategies.

See Section IX of this report for further technical assistance.

- **D.** <u>**TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT**</u> refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom that addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.
 - The district has a \$1,000 equipment threshold. Equipment meeting this threshold is tagged, as well as equipment purchased with Perkins funds.
 - DOE staff was able to locate inventoried equipment purchased with grant funds.
 - There are procedures in place for disposal of equipment.
 - Purchases of equipment more than \$35,000 require board approval.
 - Inventory is done annually.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: In an information technology classroom at Ft. White High School, there was less than one working computer per student for students receiving Microsoft instruction, a number of computers were not working and several computers were loaded with outdated software (Microsoft Windows 2003)

Recommendation: Review the equipment and software needs in this classroom

- **E.** <u>**LEARNING ENVIRONMENT**</u> encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.
 - Classroom walls are inviting and contain appropriate rules, signage and program outlines.
 - Buildings are well maintained, spacious and accessible for student use.
 - Teachers and students were observed using technology to enhance instruction.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Concern: There are no safety notices posted in the automotive service technology program at Columbia High School.

Recommendation: Post safety notices in this classroom.

- **F.** <u>ACCESS AND EQUITY</u> refers to compliance with the requirements of federal nondiscrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation and completion of programs.
 - District Perkins data reflects an improvement in the non-traditional enrollment measure that required a program improvement plan (PIP).
 - District personnel are aware of the agency non-discrimination policy and have received training.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Concern: Non-discrimination notices were broadly posted in the AE building, but these notices were not posted at either Ft. White High School or Columbia High School.

Recommendation: Non-discrimination notices must be broadly posted in both high schools.

2. Concern: Non-discrimination notices do not include genetic identity as a protected class.

Recommendation: The district must correct these notices when publications are republished.

- **G.** <u>**RECORDS REVIEW**</u> refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed:
 - Travel
 - Inventory
 - Purchases
 - Financial and board policies and procedures

- Student records
- Agency website
- Non-discrimination policies
- Advisory committee member roster and minutes
- District AE student handbook
- Program brochures
- District staff handbook
- District non-discrimination statement and policy
- National Reporting System (NRS) Report
- Program Improvement Plan (PIP)

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS None

- **H.** <u>**FINANCIAL**</u> refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs. Samples of documents may be requested and reviewed.
 - Columbia County School District has systems in place to ensure financial accountability.
 - Staff travel was reviewed; appropriate policies and procedures are followed.
 - Approval processes are in place and were documented for a sample of grant purchases.
 - A sample of purchases was tracked from purchase request through tagging and inventory.
 - Purchases are made under state contracts.
 - A P-card is issued only to the career and adult education coordinator. Internal controls are in place.
 - A district committee reviews purchase requests to determine need, reasonableness, and other legal requirements.
 - Monthly reports are run to assure that companies have not been debarred or suspended.
 - The district finance staff runs a monthly report to check expenditures against the approved budget.
 - The career and adult education coordinator receives financial reports on an ongoing basis.
 - There was discussion about two federal grants in the 2010-11 year that were not at least 90 percent expended.
 - Agency response: During that year, the coordinator's illness contributed to this occurrence.

FINDINGS

As directed by the district finance director, the career and adult education coordinator has prepared and signed final financial reports (FA 499s) for multiple federal AE grants.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

None

- I. <u>COLLABORATION</u> refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or Memoranda of Understanding that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.
 - The district is building strong relationships with business and industry, which has resulted in donated equipment.
 - A business partner at Columbia High School visits the high school daily to advise students that operate the school-based business on strategies to improve the business.
 - The AE program has strong partnerships with local agencies, including:
 - The workforce development board provides a teacher and assists students with tuition and GED® test costs
 - Happy House, Inc. provides child care slots and other services for AE students and
 - The adult literacy program at the Columbia County Public Library co-sponsors community workshops and makes referrals
 - The district has articulation and other agreements with Florida Gateway College, Santa Fe College and the University of Florida.

FINDINGS

No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS None

J. <u>PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN</u> A PIP is required when an agency does not meet 90 percent of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

PIPs were reviewed during the visit. The purpose of the review is to determine if the strategies contained in the plan are measureable and verifiable during the visit.

Discussion took place between the monitoring team and the provider's representative during the visit. Strategies identified in the plan were verified, and documentation was provided.

Secondary Performance Measures (2009-10 data) for 2011-12 grant

- Agency met or exceeded at least 90 percent of the local target except for:
 - 5S1 (Secondary Placement) 78.76 percent v. 90.31 percent target
 - o 6S1 (Non-traditional Enrollment) 10.33 percent v. 16 percent target

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- Continue activities to address measures requiring a PIP.
- **K.** <u>STUDENT PERSPECTIVE</u> The team meets with groups of students. The student perspective is presented as a portion of this report.
 - Comments overall were very positive.
 - AE and CTE students are very appreciative of and proud of their programs.

- CTE students are particularly proud of their CTSOs and student achievements in these extracurricular activities.
- Many students are enrolling in AE and CTE programs based on positive feedback by other students.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

ADULT EDUCATION

- 1. Corrective Action Plan Columbia County School District is required to complete a corrective action plan.
- 2. Action Plan The agency must provide an action plan (Appendix B) to address the concerns noted in the focus areas C and F in Section VII of this report.

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

- 1. Corrective action plan Columbia County School District is required to complete a corrective action plan.
- 2. Action plan The agency must provide an action plan (Appendix B) to address the concerns noted in the focus areas B, C, D, E and F in Section VII of this report.

Once the action plan is submitted, reviewed, and approved, if appropriate, the leader of the onsite visit is responsible for regular follow-up with the agency's designated representative to ensure that resolution is complete.

IX. TARGETED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Targeted technical assistance may be provided to support full compliance and systemic change for program improvement. Staff is encouraged to contact division staff to assist their efforts toward systemic change. For Florida CHOICES, contact Patrick Wright at Patrick.Wright@fldoe.org or 850-245-0911, or go to http://www.flchoices.org.

X. REMARKS or POSITIVE PRACTICES

The following are additional comments made by the Quality Assurance and Compliance team in regard to the monitoring visit: As indicated in this report, there are aspects of several secondary CTE programs and the Adult Education Career Pathways initiative that are noteworthy. The AE program has an extensive array of partnerships.

XI. SUMMARY

Once the field work, including receipt of requested information is completed, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed and forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties. The division's site visit leader monitors and conducts follow-up activities to assure issues have been satisfactorily completed within the stated timelines. Finally, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all of the participants in the onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks to Mary Keen, career and adult education coordinator, for her participation and leadership in this process.

Appendix A Career and Technical Education Columbia County School District

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
	\$ 2,000,001+	8		
Total amount of agency funding	700,001 - 2 million	6	4 x 6	24
from grants (2010-11)	300,001 - 700,000	5		
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2010-11)	Number of grants	2 x 2 = 4	4 x 6	24
Number of grants with 10% or more of unexpended funds (2010-11)	Number of grants	1 x 5 = 5	5 x 4	20
	16 + findings	10		
Audit findings relevant to internal	11-15 findings	8		
control weaknesses during three (3)	5-10 findings	6	10 x 10	100
previous years for targeted agency.	1-4 findings	4		
Change in director within the last two (2) fiscal years.	Yes = 1 No = 0	$0 \times 10 = 0$	0 x 4	0
TOTAL Level of Risk Score				

Appendix A Adult Education Columbia County School District

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
	\$ 2,000,001+	8	_	
Total amount of agency funding	700,001 - 2 million	6	4 x 6	24
from grants (2010-11)	300,001 - 700,000	5		
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2010-11)	Number of grants	4 x 2 = 8	8 x 6	48
Number of grants with 10% or more of unexpended funds (2010-11)	Number of grants	1 x 5 = 5	5 x 4	20
	16 + findings	10		
Audit findings relevant to internal	11-15 findings	8		
control weaknesses during three (3)	5-10 findings	6	10 x 10	100
previous years for targeted agency.	1-4 findings	4		
Change in Director within the last two (2) fiscal years.	Yes = 1 No = 0	0 x 10	0 x 4	0
TOTAL Level of Risk Score				

Appendix B Columbia County School District Resolution Plan Adult Education and Career and Technical Education

Type of Plan	Strategies	Person Responsible	Projected Date of Completion
Corrective Action Plan Finding: The automotive service technology program at Columbia High School is not National Automotive Technician Education Foundation (NATEF) accredited as required by Section 1004.295, Florida Statutes.	The instructor has completed the course work, and we are working on coordinating the certification process through NATEF to bring the program into compliance.	Alex Carswell, Sheri Keen and Todd Widergren	We will begin the process in August, 2013. We anticipate this will take 18 months to complete.
 Finding: As directed by the district finance director, the career and AE coordinator has prepared and signed final financial reports (FA 499s) for multiple federal adult education grants. "The Finance Office or authorized representative must certify and date the project disbursement report on the last page." See instructions for FA 499 in Project Application and Amendment Procedures for Federal and State Programs (Green Book). 	We will no longer have the AE coordinator prepare and sign the final financial reports (FA-499s). We will follow the procedures outlined in the Green Book referenced.	Alex Carswell, Sheri Keen and finance director Bonnie Penner	July 1, 2013

	tion Plan ncerns:			
1.	CTE program staff has limited involvement with secondary CTE data submission to ensure data accuracy and timeliness.	The CTE program staff will review the data prior to submission and continue to review the data to ensure the accuracy and timeliness of that data.	Alex Carswell and Sheri Keen	June 2014
2.	In the automotive service technology program at Columbia High School, textbooks are dated 2004 and may not be current; there are no computers in this classroom.	New/current textbooks will be purchased and computers will be utilized in the program for the 2013- 14 school year.	Sheri Keen and Todd Widergren	August 19, 2013
3.	While most GED [®] (General Education Development [®]) teachers are receiving staff development for the new GED [®] test that takes effect in January 2014, at least one instructor has not received this training to date.	All instructors will be given staff development for the new GED test that takes effect January 2014.	Alex Carswell	August 19, 2013
4.	While career guidance is a strong emphasis in the district's AE Program, CTE students are receiving limited career guidance assistance in the high schools.	Each high school will have a dedicated guidance counselor that will assist CTE students in their career choices/guidance.	Alex Carswell and high school principals	August 19, 2013

5. In an information technology classroom at Ft. White High School, there was less than one working computer per student for students receiving Microsoft instruction, a number of computers were not working and several computers were loaded with outdated software (Microsoft Windows 2003).	The information technology classroom will have all computers inspected and brought up to the standard working condition and loaded with Microsoft Windows.	Keith Couey & Sheri Keen	August 19, 2013	
6. There are no safety notices posted in the automotive service technology program at Columbia High School.	There will be safety notices posted in the Automotive Services Program at Columbia High School.	Todd Widergren & Sheri Keen	August 19, 2013	
 Non-discrimination notices were broadly posted in the AE building, but were not posted at either Ft. White High School or Columbia High School. 	Non-discrimination notices will be posted at Columbia High School and Ft. White High School.	Principals & Sheri Keen	August 19, 2013	
 Non-discrimination notices do not include genetic identity as a protected class. 	Genetic identity will be added to our non-discrimination notices.	Narragansett Smith	August 19, 2013	
Technical Assistance Needed and/or Provided:				
Plan submitted by (name and title): <u>Alex L. Carswell, Assistant Superintendent</u> Date: <u>8/12/2013</u>				

Plan accepted by: <u>Ellen McCarron, Director – Quality Assurance & Compliance</u> Date: <u>8/13/2013</u>	
Status of Resolution Plan (to be completed by DOE staff)	
Date	Status of Plan Completion