Quality Assurance and Compliance
Onsite Monitoring Visit
for
Career and Technical Education

Chipola College
April 17-18, 2013

Final Report

June 19, 2013

FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

Dr. Tony Bennett
Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor
Career and Adult Education

June 19, 2013

Dr. Gene Prough
President
Chipola College
3094 Indian Circle
Marianna, Florida 32446

Dear Dr. Prough:

We are pleased to provide you with the Final Report of monitoring of the Career and Technical Education programs from our visit. The report will also be placed on our website at http://www.fldoe.org/workforce/compliance.asp.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during the review process. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Rick Lockenbach, J.D., program specialist with Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9025, or via electronic mail at rick.lockenbach@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuing commitment to improve services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/pr

Enclosure

cc: Dr. Jason Hurst
       Rick Lockenbach, J.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Florida Department of Education
Division of Career and Adult Education

Chipola College
Career and Technical Education
Quality Assurance Monitoring Report

I.   INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (DCAE), in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance Division is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the Quality Assurance System is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the DCAE to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II.   AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE) for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006. FDOE awards sub grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and adult education/family literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations (34 CFR 76.770). The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education is required to oversee the performance of Florida state colleges in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional cites noting authority to monitor and pertinent laws and regulations are located in the 2012-2013 *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols*, Module A, Section 1.

III.   QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The *Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols* (Manual) was revised in the 2012-13 program year. The Manual was provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The Manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the Manual in this document; it is located on the DCAE's website at
http://www.FDOE.org/workforce/compliance.asp.

IV.   PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the Quality Assurance System. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based.

Risk Assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the FDOE and the DCAE. A Risk Matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors, is completed for each provider. The Risk Matrix is located in Appendix A. The results of the Risk Assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Chipola College (CC) was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Dr. Gene Prough, CC President, on October 26, 2012. The designated representative for the agency was Dr. Jason Hurst, Executive Vice President of Baccalaureate and Occupational Education Programs.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted on April 17-8, 2013, by two representatives of the Quality Assurance and Compliance section of the DCAE: Program Specialists Rick Lockenbach, J.D., and Sheryl Walden.

V.   CHIPOLA COLLEGE

2011-12 Career and Technical Education (CTE) Enrollment: 603 (duplicate count)

The provider was awarded the following grants for FYs 2010-11 and 2011-12:

2010-2011
CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

Type	Total	Unexpended Funds
Postsecondary	$82,068	$0
Rural	$29,440	$0

2011-2012
CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION GRANTS

Type	Total	Unexpended Funds
Postsecondary	$66,091	$0
Rural	$27,000	$0

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: http://www.chipola.edu.

VI.   MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre-visit planning conference calls, an entrance conference, interviews with administrators, teachers, and students; observations; record reviews, and an exit conference.

<u>Onsite Visit</u>
Members of the team made an onsite visit to Marianna Campus.

<u>Entrance and Exit Conferences</u>
The entrance conference for CC was conducted on April 17, 2013, and the exit conference was conducted on April 18, 2013. The participants are listed below:

	Title		**Exit Conference**
Agency Participants			
Dr. Jason Hurst	Executive Vice President of Baccalaureate and Occupational Education Programs	X	X
Jayne Roberts	Vice President of Student Affairs	X	
Dennis Everett	Associate Vice President of Information Services	X	
Steve Young	Vice President of Finance	X	X
Jim Dunaway	Property and Inventory	X	
Janice Holley	Workforce Development, Perkins	X	X
Wendy Pippens	Human Resources Coordinator	X	
FDOE Monitoring Team			
Rick Lockenbach, J.D.	Program Specialist	X	X
Sheryl Walden	Program Specialist	X	X

<u>Interviews/Observations</u>
Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff, program and transition specialists, and students. Fourteen interviews and four observations were conducted. All interviews and observations were held during the course of the visit.

<u>Records Review</u>
Program, financial and administrative records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in Section VIII, Section G. Agency policies and procedures were reviewed at the agency's website and discussed at various times during the onsite visit.

VII.   RESULTS

Chipola College
April 17-18, 2013

A. **ADMINISTRATION** refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight, and other administrative areas.

- Substantial support for CTE programs exists at all levels.
- CC administration is proactive in pursuing adequate resources for programs.
  - CC has secured US Department of Labor funding to develop a welding program.
- The college is working to improve and expand their CTE programs.
- There is strong communication among different levels at the College.
- The faculty and administration are experienced and have a wealth of knowledge of the CTE programs.
- CC encourages and supports the pursuit of staff development.
- The Executive Vice President of Baccalaureate and Occupational Education Programs is a knowledgeable and experienced CTE administrator.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

B. **DATA** refers to all the components of the data system including data collection, entry, and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.

- The process for data collection and reporting was reviewed as well as a sample of CTE students from the agency data base who earned industry certification and completed programs.
- CC Management Information System (MIS) staff is experienced and well familiar with the agency data base.
- College staff participates in the FDOE Management Information Systems Advisory Committee and meetings.
- Data is being used by CTE programs for program improvement purposes, including the expansion of programs.
- The College is converting their current data system to Jenzabar.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Concern: The CTE program staff has limited involvement with data submission to ensure data accuracy and timeliness.

Recommendation: Develop an internal review process that includes the CTE program staff to review data, including available edit reports, prior to the required load date through the end of the submission period for each survey period.

See Section IX of this report for further technical assistance.

C. **CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION** refers to those elements which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and instructor observations.

- Instructional materials are current and are being used by students.
- Varied instructional strategies are being employed.
- Interaction between instructors and students was very positive.
- Many faculty members are going "over and beyond" to meet student needs.
- The CTE programs are working toward improving industry certification passing rates.
- The Automotive Services Technology (AST) Program was ranked one of the top four in the country for 2012.
- The Cosmetology Program has upgraded their curriculum to Pivotpoint to improve student outcomes.
- A team from CC recently won a national competition of the Future Business Leaders of America (FBLA); other students also placed in this competition.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Concern: A number of students have had difficulty in the Cosmetology Program due to limited academic proficiency when they entered the program. If the Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE) was administered before program entry, appropriate counseling and remediation could occur before a student enters the program.

Recommendation: Review the process regarding when TABE is administered for students whose intent is entry into post-secondary adult vocational (PSAV) certificate programs.

D. **TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT** refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom; addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.

- There is a $1,000 equipment threshold, and equipment meeting this threshold is tagged.
- Computers are purchased under a Florida state college program for acquisition of this equipment.
- A sample of equipment purchased with equipment funds was located.
- A laptop purchased with Perkins funds was stolen from shipping and receiving. An incident report was filed with the sheriff's department as prescribed by board policy. Corrective action has been taken to improve security, including ensuring that upon receipt, all mail is under lock and key. Computers are promptly sent to the Information Technology Office to be tagged so they can be tracked and made a part of their inventory.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

Concern: Two iPads located in Automotive Service Technology (AST) were numbered with a marker that was beginning to rub off.

Recommendation: Utilize etching or other form of more permanent engraving system.

E. **LEARNING ENVIRONMENT** encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy, and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.

- Classroom walls are inviting and contain appropriate rules, signage, and program outlines.
- Buildings are well maintained, spacious, and accessible for student use.
- There were no safety issues.
- Technology is well integrated in the classroom.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

F. **ACCESS AND EQUITY** refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation, and completion of programs.

- Non-discrimination notices were broadly posted.
- College personnel are aware of who the Equity Officer is and have received staff development in this area.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Concern: A review of printed program materials, including program brochures, indicates that these publications do not uniformly contain non-discrimination notices.

Recommendation: The district must correct these notices when publications are republished.

G. **RECORDS REVIEW** refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.
- Travel
- Inventory
- Financial policies and procedures
- Student records
- Agency Website

- Non-discrimination policies
- Advisory committee handbook and survey
- CC student handbook and catalog
- Agency brochures

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

H. FINANCIAL refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management, and allowable costs.

- Financial procedures are intended to ensure secure internal controls.
- Approval processes are in place and were documented for a sample of grant purchases.
- Representative purchases were tracked from purchase request through tagging and inventory.
- P-cards are not being used for CTE purposes.
- All Perkins funds were 100% expended.
- The Financial Director is experienced and knowledgeable.

FINDINGS

The college expended funds to purchase equipment for the AST Program before the effective date of an amendment submitted to the Florida Department of Education. In accordance with *Project Application and Amendment Procedures for Federal and State Programs (Green Book), B-3,* "A project recipient may not begin to expend or obligate federal funds under a project amendment until the latter of the following two dates: (1) the date the department receives the amendment in substantially approvable form or (2) the date approved by the department Program Manager."

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

I. COLLABORATION refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.

- The college is building strong relationships with business and industry in counties being served. The Vice President of Baccalaureate and Occupational Programs participates in several partnerships that foster these relationships.
- CC is expanding paid internships for students in the CTE programs.
- The local Workforce Development Board has an office on campus.
- Advisory committees are providing substantial curriculum and other support for CTE programs.

       o   There is a handbook for members. Committees meet at least twice a year, and member surveys are conducted.
- CTE programs including AST and Networking Services Technology are utilizing donated equipment, including a Ford Mustang salvaged from Hurricane Katrina.
- The AST program has assisted over 30 other CTE programs in Florida pursuing National Automotive Technicians Education Foundation (NATEF) accreditation.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

J. PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN- A Program Improvement Plan (PIP) is required when an agency does not meet 90% of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

A PIP is required for the performance levels that did not meet at least 90% of each agreed-upon target and is included in the grant. The purpose of the review is to determine if the strategies contained in the plan are measureable and verifiable during the visit.

Postsecondary (2009-10 data)
- The agency met at least 90% of the local agency target except for:
    - o 4P1 College Credit Placement–78% v. 87% target.
    - o 3A1 Certificate Retention or Transfer–63% v. 69% target.
- For the 2011-12 year, PIPs were required and are included in the grant.

Discussion took place between the monitoring team and the provider's representative during the visit. Strategies identified in the plans were verified, and documentation was provided.

General Recommendation:
- Continue activities to improve these measures.

K. STUDENT PERSPECTIVE–The team met with groups of students. Their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.

- Comments from students about their CTE programs overall were very positive, and they were very appreciative and proud of their programs.
- Students are getting the support they need from all levels at the college, instructional and administrative, and there is a high level of responsiveness to student need.
- Students are clear on their objectives for further education or employment after they complete their programs.

FINDINGS
No findings of non-compliance were noted at this time.

CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
None

VIII.   REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

1. Corrective Action Plan – Chipola College is required to complete a Corrective Action Plan for the finding in focus area H.

2. Action Plan - The agency must provide an Action Plan (Appendix B) to address the concerns noted in the focus areas B, C, D, and F in Section VII of this report.

Once the Action Plan is submitted, reviewed, and approved, the co-leader of the onsite visit is responsible for the regular follow-up with the agency's designated representative to ensure that resolution is complete.

IX.   TARGETED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Targeted technical assistance may be provided to support full compliance and systemic change for program improvement. Staff is encouraged to contact Division staff to assist their efforts toward systemic change.

- For data assistance, contact Joan Roddenberry at joan.roddenberry@fldoe.org or 850-245-9512.

X.   REMARKS or POSITIVE PRACTICES

The following are additional comments made by the Quality Assurance and Compliance Team in regard to the monitoring visit: Several students interviewed commended college personnel, both faculty and administrative, for the level of support provided by CC. One student commented that all the support one needed was available through the college.

XI.   SUMMARY

Once the field work, including receipt of requested information, is completed, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed and forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties. Finally, the DCAE issues a Closure Notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding items have been completed.

We want to extend our appreciation to all participants in the CC's onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks to Dr. Jason Hurst, Executive Vice President of Baccalaureate and Occupational Education Programs, for his participation and leadership in this process.

Risk Matrix
Chipola College
Career and Technical Education
Appendix A

Risk Factor	Criteria Scale	Value	Risk Factor Weight	Total Points
Total amount of agency funding from grants (2010-11)	$ 2,000,001+	8	**4** x 6	24
	700,001 – 2,000,000	**6**		
	300,001 – 700,000	5		
	< 300,000	4		
Number of grants per agency (2010-11)	Number of grants	2 x 2 = **4**	**4** x 6	24
Number of grants with **10%** or more of unexpended funds (2010-11)	Number of grants	**0** x 5 = 0	**0** x 4	0
Audit findings relevant to internal control weaknesses during three (3) previous years for targeted agency.	16 + findings	10	**8** x 10	80
	11-15 findings	**8**		
	5-10 findings	6		
	1-4 findings	4		
Change in Director within the last two (2) fiscal years.	Yes = 1 No = 0	**1** x 10 = 10	**10** x 4	40
		TOTAL Level of Risk Score		**168**

Chipola College Resolution Plan
Career and Technical Education
Appendix B

Type of Plan	Strategies	Person Responsible	Projected Date of Completion
Corrective Action Plan Finding(s): The college expended funds to purchase equipment for the AST Program before the effective date of an amendment submitted to the Florida Department of Education. In accordance with *Project Application and Amendment Procedures for Federal and State Programs (Green Book), B-3,* "A project recipient may not begin to expend or obligate federal funds under a project amendment until the latter of the following two dates: (1) the date the Department receives the amendment in substantially approvable form or (2) date approved by department Program Manager."	Amendment approval date will be stated on the purchase order prior to the signatures of the requester and department manager.	Janice Holley, Workforce Development (WFD) Jason Hurst, Ph.D. Executive Vice President Of Baccalaureate and Occupational Education Programs (Executive Vice President)	July 1, 2013

Action Plan Concern(s):			
1. CTE program staff has limited involvement with data submission to ensure data accuracy and timeliness.	Information Systems will complete the initial loading of data for the FDOE. FDOE will generate reports. Reports will be reviewed within the weeks allowed by FDOE by Janice Holley, WFD, and all program managers. Any data anomalies will be noted and the data center will correct and report.	Janice Holley, Workforce Development (WFD) Jason Hurst, Ph.D., Executive Vice President	July 1, 2013
2. A number of students have had difficulty in the Cosmetology Program due to limited academic proficiency when they entered the program. If the Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE) was administered before program entry, appropriate counseling and remediation could occur before a student enters the program.	This is governed by Section 1004.91, *Florida Statutes.* "(2) Students who enroll in a program offered for career credit of 450 hours or more shall complete an entry-level examination within the first 6 weeks of admission into the program." Each student receives a packet with admission policies stating the requirements of the TABE test, and we will continue to encourage each student to take the test prior to registration.	Paige Vanderwerf, Cosmetology Program Manager Janice Holley, WFD Jason Hurst, Ph. D., Executive Vice President	July 1, 2013

3. Two iPads located in Automotive Service Technology (AST) were numbered with a marker that was beginning to rub off.	Jim Dunaway, Property /Inventory & Records will meet with Dennis Everett, Associate Vice President of Information Systems, to determine an appropriate method of inscribing iPads and other small devices without causing any damage to the item.	Jim Dunaway, Property/Inventory & Records Dennis Everett, Associate Vice President of Information Systems Jason Hurst, Ph.D., Executive Vice President	July 1, 2013
4. A review of printed program materials, including program brochures, indicates that these publications do not uniformly contain non-discrimination notices.	Non-discrimination notices will be added when brochures are republished. A sample copy with the revised language will be emailed.	Evelyn Ward, Publications Coordinator Janice Holley, WFD Jason Hurst, Ph.D., Executive Vice President	June 30, 2013

Technical Assistance Needed and/or Provided:

Plan submitted by (name and title): Jason Hurst, Ph.D., Executive Vice President_____Date: May 30, 2013

Plan accepted by:_____Date:_____

Status of Resolution Plan (to be completed by DOE staff)

Date	Status of Plan Completion